



Ceredo-Kenova School in Wayne County

- Winning bidder Neighborall Construction uses local workers and at times pays more than prevailing wage rates
- Owners of 2nd and 3rd place bidders repeatedly claimed the elimination of prevailing wage would result in 25% to 30% savings and their bids had ZERO savings and would've cost taxpayers MORE
- 2nd Place bidder Jarrett Construction opposes paying prevailing wage but was \$183,000 higher than winning bid
- 3rd place bidder Swope Construction claimed a 25% to 30% savings would result if prevailing wage was eliminated but bid \$500,000 more than Neighborall

Click on items below for documentation:

The Bid	2
Post Bid	10

BID TABULATION SHEET

Ceredo Kenova Elementary School

300 9th Street

Kenova, WV 25530

18-Aug-2015

ZMM Commission No. 1257

Bid Start Time	1:30
Bid Finish Time	2:09

Bid Package A - General Trades

Bidder	Swope Construction	Geiger Brothers	Paramount Builders	MI-De-Con	City Construction	G&G Builders	Neighborgall Construction	Maynard C. Smith
Base Bid	8 614 000			8 734 000		8 960 000	8 251 000	
Alternate No. 1 VCT in lieu of VET (Deduct)	79 000			43 900		36 000	35 500	
Unit Price No. 1 300 CY Soil Replacement	35/cy			30/cy		34/cy	32/cy	
Unit Price No. 2 100 CY Soil Replacement w/ CLSM	160/cy			185/cy		138/cy	132/cy	
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%	✓			✓		✓	✓	
Addenda Received (4 total)	✓			✓		✓	✓	

Bidder	Jarrett Construction	E.P. Leach & Sons	Mascaro Construction	Hayslett Construction	KMLRCC			
Base Bid	8 699 000			8 694 000				
Alternate No. 1 VCT in lieu of VET (Deduct)	82 890			60,000				
Unit Price No. 1 300 CY Soil Replacement	3000/cy			20/cy				
Unit Price No. 2 100 CY Soil Replacement w/ CLSM	12500/cy			90/cy				
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%	✓			✓				
Addenda Received (4 total)	✓			✓				

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must fax their Sub-Contractor, Equipment/Material Supplier List to the SBA (304)-558-2539) with a copy to the Architect (304)-345-8144) within 2 hours of the close of the bids.

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must submit the Contractors Qualification Statement to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

The apparent Low Bid Contractor in compliance with WV Code 5-22-1, Article 22, must submit SBA Bid Certification to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

BID TABULATION SHEET

Ceredo Kenova Elementary School

300 9th Street

Kenova, WV 25530

18-Aug-2015

ZMM Commission No. 1257

Bid Start Time
Bid Finish Time

Bid Package B- Plumbing

Bidder	Rock Branch Mechanical	DSO Mechanical	Pennington Plumbing &	Phillip S. Johnson	Stuart McMunn	Dougherty Company		
Base Bid								
Alternate No. 2 Pulper/Extractor System (Add)								
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%								
Addenda Received (4 total)								
Bidder								
Base Bid								
Alternate No. 2 Pulper/Extractor System (Add)								
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%								
Addenda Received (4 total)								

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must fax their Sub-Contractor, Equipment/Material Supplier List to the SBA (304)-558-2539) with a copy to the Architect (304)-345-8144) within 2 hours of the close of the bids.

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must submit the Contractors Qualification Statement to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

The apparent Low Bid Contractor in compliance with WV Code 5-22-1, Article 22, must submit SBA Bid Certification to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

BID TABULATION SHEET

Ceredo Kenova Elementary School

300 9th Street

Kenova, WV 25530

18-Aug-2015

ZMM Commission No. 1257

Bid Start Time
Bid Finish Time

Bid Package C- HVAC

Bidder	Rock Branch Mechanical	DSO Mechanical	Pennington Plumbing &	Phillip S. Johnson	Stuart McMunn	Dougherty Company		
Base Bid		1718 000						
Andover Controls		235 200						
ASI Controls		175 960						
Johnson Controls								
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%		✓						
Addenda Received (4 total)		✓						
Bidder								
Base Bid								
Andover Controls								
ASI Controls								
Johnson Controls								
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%								
Addenda Received (4 total)								

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must fax their Sub-Contractor, Equipment/Material Supplier List to the SBA (304)-558-2539 with a copy to the Architect (304)-346-8144 within 2 hours of the close of the bids.

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must submit the Contractors Qualification Statement to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

The apparent Low Bid Contractor in compliance with WV Code 5-22-1, Article 22, must submit SBA Bid Certification to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

BID TABULATION SHEET

Ceredo Kenova Elementary School

300 9th Street

Kenova, WV 25530

18-Aug-2015

ZMM Commission No. 1257

Bid Start Time
Bid Finish Time

Bid Package D - Plumbing & HVAC

Bidder	Rock Branch Mechanical	DSO Mechanical	Pennington Plumbing &	Phillip S. Johnson	Stuart McMunn	Dougherty Company		
Base Bid		2 663 000	2 338 000			2 398 000		
Alternate No. 2 Pulper/Extractor System (Add)		28 470	58 000			45 000		
Andover Controls		235 200	210 000			230 000		
ASI Controls		176 960	158 000			185 000		
Johnson Controls								
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%		✓	✓			✓		
Addenda Received (4 total)		✓	✓			✓		
Bidder								
Base Bid								
Alternate No. 2 Pulper/Extractor System (Add)								
Andover Controls								
ASI Controls								
Johnson Controls								
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%								
Addenda Received (4 total)								

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must fax their Sub-Contractor, Equipment/Material Supplier List to the SBA (304)-558-2539 with a copy to the Architect (304)-345-8144) within 2 hours of the close of the bids.

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must submit the Contractors Qualification Statement to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

The apparent Low Bid Contractor in compliance with WV Code 5-22-1, Article 22, must submit SBA Bid Certification to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

BID TABULATION SHEET

Ceredo Kenova Elementary School

300 9th Street

Kenova, WV 25530

18-Aug-2015

ZMM Commission No. 1257

Bid Start Time
Bid Finish Time

Bid Package E- Electrical

Bidder	Progressive Electric	Trico Electric	Dixon Electric	Jordan Smith Electric				
Base Bid	1 550 000		1 266 605	1 333 300				
Alternate No. 2 Pulper/Extractor System (Add)	8 000		5 300	4 200				
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%	✓		✓	✓				
Addenda Received (4 total)	✓		✓	✓				
Bidder								
Base Bid								
Alternate No. 2 Pulper/Extractor System (Add)								
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%								
Addenda Received (4 total)								

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must fax their Sub-Contractor, Equipment/Material Supplier List to the SBA (304)-558-2539 with a copy to the Architect (304)-345-8144) within 2 hours of the close of the bids.

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must submit the Contractors Qualification Statement to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

The apparent Low Bid Contractor in compliance with WV Code 5-22-1, Article 22, must submit SBA Bid Certification to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

BID TABULATION SHEET

Ceredo Kenova Elementary School

300 9th Street

Kenova, WV 25530

18-Aug-2015

ZMM Commission No. 1257

Bid Start Time
Bid Finish Time

Bid Package F - Fire Protection

Bidder	Brewer & Company	VFP Fire Systems	S.A. Comunale					
Base Bid	132 000	129 230	122 200					
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%	✓	✓	✓					
Addenda Received (4 total)	✓	✓	✓					
Bidder								
Base Bid								
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%								
Addenda Received (4 total)								

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must fax their Sub-Contractor, Equipment/Material Supplier List to the SBA (304)-558-2538) with a copy to the Architect (304)-345-8144) within 2 hours of the close of the bids.

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must submit the Contractors Qualification Statement to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

The apparent Low Bid Contractor in compliance with WV Code 5-22-1, Article 22, must submit SBA Bid Certification to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

BID TABULATION SHEET

Ceredo Kenova Elementary School

300 9th Street

Kenova, WV 25530

18-Aug-2015

ZMM Commission No. 1257

Bid Start Time
Bid Finish Time

Bid Package G - General Construction

Bidder	Swope Construction	Geiger Brothers	Paramount Builders	MI-De-Con	City Construction	G&G Builders	Neighborgall Construction	Maynard C. Smith (MCS)
Base Bid	12 899 900				13 683 000		12 400 000	13 248 000
Alternate No. 1 VCT in lieu of VET (Deduct)	79 000				73 500		35 500	80 000
Alternate No. 2 Pulper/Extractor System (Add)	271 000				339 734		300 000	325 000
Unit Price No. 1 300 CY Soil Replacement	35/cy				24/cy		32/cy	24/cy
Unit Price No. 2 100 CY Soil Replacement w/ CLSM	160/cy				93/cy		132/cy	94/cy
Andover Controls	229 000				210 000		233 000	250 000
ASI Controls	165 000				158 000		188 000	200 000
Johnson Controls								
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%	✓				✓		✓	✓
Addenda Received (4 total)	✓				✓		✓	✓

Bidder	Jarrett Construction	E.P. Leach & Sons	Mascaro Construction	Hayslett Construction	KMLRCC			
Base Bid	12 583 000							
Alternate No. 1 VCT in lieu of VET (Deduct)	82 890							
Alternate No. 2 Pulper/Extractor System (Add)	301 500							
Unit Price No. 1 300 CY Soil Replacement	3000 /cy							
Unit Price No. 2 100 CY Soil Replacement w/ CLSM	12500/cy							
Andover Controls	225 000							
ASI Controls	165 000							
Johnson Controls								
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%	✓							
Addenda Received (4 total)	✓							

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must fax their Sub-Contractor, Equipment/Material Supplier List to the SBA (304)-558-2538) with a copy to the Architect (304)-345-8144) within 2 hours of the close of the bids.

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must submit the Contractors Qualification Statement to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

The apparent Low Bid Contractor in compliance with WV Code 8-22-1, Article 22, must submit SBA Bid Certification to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

BID TABULATION SHEET

Ceredo Kenova Elementary School

300 9th Street

Kenova, WV 25530

18-Aug-2015

ZMM Commission No. 1257

Bid Start Time
Bid Finish Time

Bid Package H - Kitchen Equipment

Bidder	C&T Design & Equipment	Colonial Food Service						
Base Bid	354 000	448 732						
Alternate No. 2 Pulper/Extractor System (Add)	223 000	245 588						
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%	✓	✓						
Addenda Received (4 total)	✓	✓						
Bidder								
Base Bid								
Alternate No. 2 Pulper/Extractor System (Add)								
Total Building Cost								
Bid Bond 5%								
Addenda Received (4 total)								

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must fax their Sub-Contractor, Equipment/Material Supplier List to the SBA (304)-558-2839 with a copy to the Architect (304)-345-8144 within 2 hours of the close of the bids.

The apparent Low Bid Contractor must submit the Contractors Qualification Statement to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

The apparent Low Bid Contractor in compliance with WV Code 5-22-1, Article 22, must submit SBA Bid Certification to the SBA within 72 hours of the close of the Bids

The New
Ceredo Kenova Elementary School
 Wayne County Board of Education
 Wayne, West Virginia

Probable Projected Construction Costs
Single Prime Contract - Post Bid Phase

Design Enrollment 602 Students - Grades PK thru 5
 Design Enrollment Projections were provided by Wayne County Schools

Prepared by ZMM, Inc., Architects & Engineers
 August 19, 2015

	Quantity	Unit	Cost \ Unit	Program Cost	Actual Cost Subtotal	Actual Cost
Building Demolition and Abatement - Atlantic Plant Services						
a. Demolition and Abatement	1	LS	2,400,000	2,400,000		
Demolition - (three school buildings)					421,906.13	
Demolition and Abatement (three buildings)					469,084.23	
b. Change Order No. 1 - Atlantic Plant Services						
Additional Fill Material					27,887	
c. Demolition and Abatement					78,983	
Demolition and Abatement (three homes and misc. out buildings)						
d. Additional Property Purchase					368,621	
Four Properties						
Total Demolition and Abatement Cost				\$2,400,000		\$1,356,481

	Quantity	Unit	Cost \ Unit	Program Cost	Actual Cost Subtotal	Actual Cost
Building Construction - Neighborgall Construction Co.						
a. New Building Construction	63,649	SF	252	\$16,039,548.00	12,400,000	12,400,000
Building Construction with Site Utilities and Sitework						
b. Alternate No. 1 - VCT deduct					(35,500)	
c. Alternate No. 2 - Pulper Extractor System					300,000	300,000
d. Andover Controls					233,000	233,000
e. ASI Controls					488,000	
f. Testing Adjusting & Balancing	1	LS	30,000	30,000	0	0
g. Furniture & Equipment	63,649	SF	17	1,062,033		
Total Building Construction Cost				\$17,151,581		\$14,015,033

Total Probable Projected Building Construction Cost					\$15,371,514
Square Foot Costs					241.50

	Quantity	Unit	Cost \ Unit	Extension
Miscellaneous Costs				
a. Advertising & Legal (estimate)		Est		5,000
b. Survey		LS		15,000
c. Geotechnical Investigation (Design Phase)		LS		10,500
c. Geotechnical Testing (Demo. Phase)		LS		28,000
c. Additional Geotechnical Testing (Demo Phase)		LS		14,000
c. Geotechnical Testing (Bidg Const. Phase)		LS		76,000
d. Contingency (2%)	14,015,033	%	2.0%	280,301
e. Design Fees	15,371,514	%	5.75%	883,862
f. Clerk of Works	16	MO	4,584	73,344
g. PCS Fees & Const Schedule	1	LS	70,727	70,727
h. Commissioning Agent	1	EST	75,000	75,000
i. Fire Marshall Review Fee (estimate)		Est		10,000
J. NPDES Permit		LS		1,170
Subtotal Misc Costs				1,542,904

Total Probable Project Cost	\$16,914,418
<i>Square Foot Costs</i>	265.75

Funding Allocations

SBA Needs Grant	8,702,833.17
Local Funds - Site Acquisition/Site Development	11,697,350.83
Total Funding	\$20,399,984

Project Under / (Over) Projected Funding	\$3,485,566
---	--------------------